DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 095 359 CE 001 917

TITLE	Cost Variations in Driver Education: A Survey of 67 Public School Programs.
INSTITUTION	New York State Office of Education Performance Review, Albany.
PUB DATE	Apr 74
NOTE	33p.
EDRS PRICE	MF-$0.75 HC-$1.85 PLUS POSTAGE
DESCRIPTORS	*Cost Effectiveness; *Driver Education; Educational Accountability; Educational Assessment; *Educational Finance; *Expenditure Per Student; Expenditures; Program Costs; Program Evaluation; *State Programs; State Surveys
IDENTIFIERS	New York State

ABSTRACT

Driver Education is one of the most expensive courses on a per pupil basis offered in secondary schools. In order to assess the magnitude of driver education in New York State, and to evaluate the various methods and approaches used to teach the course, the Office of Education Performance Review surveyed 67 driver education programs offered at various school districts throughout the State. The wide variation in driver education costs--from $49 to $362 per pupil--is attributable to the method and approach used to teach the course. Driver education taught using the dual control method during the regular school day cost an average of $162 per pupil. The same course taught at a time other than during the regular school day cost an average of $93, making the regular school day program $69 or 74 percent more costly. Costs could be greatly reduced by scheduling driver education programs before or after the regular school day, on Saturdays, or as a summer program, and contracting with a commercial driving school for the laboratory portion. An appendix lists cost and enrollment data for all 67 programs. (MW)

ED 095359

CE

STATE OF NEW YORK

OFFICE OF EDUCATION PERFORMANCE REVIEW

COST VARIATIONS IN DRIVER EDUCATION
A SURVEY OF 67 PUBLIC SCHOOL PROGRAMS

APRIL 1974

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

CE001917

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SUMMARY	1
BACKGROUND	7
FINDINGS	12
Regular School Day - Dual Control	13
Regular School Day - Simulator	16
Regular School Day - Commercial Driving School	17
After School, Saturday and Summer-Dual Control	19
After School, Saturday and Summer-Simulator	21
After School, Saturday and Summer-Commercial Driving School	22
Personal Benefits	24
RECOMMENDATIONS	26
APPENDIX	28

SUMMARY

Driver education, although popular, is one of the most expensive courses on a per pupil basis offered in secondary schools of New York State.

No information is available on the total statewide cost of driver education. In order to assess the magnitude of driver education in New York State, and to evaluate the various methods and approaches used to teach the course, the Office of Education Performance Review surveyed 67 driver education programs offered at various school districts throughout the State.*

The 67 programs surveyed were conducted in the following manner:

- 32 were taught during the regular school day using the dual control method, which entails students practicing driving on public highways in a car equipped with dual control brakes;
- 4 were taught during the regular school day using simulators, an electro-mechanical device, similar to a Link trainer;
- 3 took place during the regular school day and used a commercial driving school to teach students the laboratory or driving portion of the course;

---

* See Appendix for a complete listing of cost and enrollment data for all 67 programs.

- 16 were taught either after school, on Saturdays, or in a summer school program, using the dual control method;
- 9 were taught after school, on Saturdays, or in a summer program using a driving simulator; and
- 3 were conducted after school, on Saturdays, or in a summer program, with a commercial driving school teaching the laboratory segment of the course.

Findings

A total of 11,313 students were enrolled in the 67 programs, at a total cost of $1,477,949. Per pupil costs ranged from $49 to $362 averaging $131. Based on this sample, it can be estimated that the statewide cost of driver education during the 1972-73 school year was approximately $20 million.*

Teacher salaries and fringe benefits ranged up to 99 percent of total program costs, averaging 87 percent. If programs using commercial driving schools were excluded, teacher salaries and fringes averaged 95 percent of total program costs.

The number of students enrolled in a program does not directly correlate with costs. A dual control, regular school day program in Genesee County for 73 students cost $14,285, while the same type of program for 73 students in

---

* 152,214 (1972-73 statewide enrollment) x $131 (average survey per pupil cost) = $19.94 million.

Madison County offered through a shared-services program cost $7,810, a difference of 83 percent.

A Suffolk County school district operated a program for 168 students at a cost of $14,373, while one Erie County school program for 220 pupils cost $15,092.

The specific method used to teach the course, as well as the time of year or time of day that it is offered does affect costs. The following are the average per pupil costs for each type of program:

Regular School Day*	
Dual control	$162
Simulator	$150
Commercial driving school	$123
After School, Saturdays, and Summer*	
Dual control	$ 93
Simulator	$101
Commercial driving school	$ 72

- The highest average per pupil cost, $162, was 225 percent of the lowest average per pupil cost, $72.
- Regular school day programs (all methods) averaged $154 per pupil; non-regular school day programs (all methods) averaged $92 per pupil, a savings of $62 or 40 percent.

---

* In all cases the classroom portion of the course was taught by a certified secondary school teacher.

- Regular school day programs using a driving simulator were only seven percent less costly than regular school day dual control programs. The simulator program costs do not include capital amortization charges which, if included, would raise program costs.
- 32 of the 67 programs, or almost 48 percent of the sample, offered the course through the method and approach (regular school day, dual control) which was, on average, the most costly way surveyed.
- Only three schools, accounting for less than five percent of the sample, offered the course using the method and approach having the lowest average per pupil cost (after school, Saturdays, and summer, commercial driving school).
- Regular school day, dual control programs were $39 or 32 percent more costly than programs using commercial driving schools to teach the in-car portion of the course.
- Dual control programs taught during the regular school day are, on average, $69 or 74 percent more costly than similar programs offered at times other than the regular school day.
- The most costly way of offering driver education (regular school day, dual control) averaged $90

or 125 percent more per pupil than the least costly manner (after school, Saturday, and summer, commercial driving school).

- Based on these averages, a school now offering driver education to 300 students during the regular school day and teaching the course through the traditional dual control method, could save $27,000 a year by contracting with a commercial driving school to teach the in-car portion, and by offering the course at a time other than the regular school day.

Recommendations

In view of this disparity of expenditures, and the fact that certain methods and approaches can dramatically reduce costs without a demonstrable difference in effectiveness, school district boards of education should promptly

- determine the true and complete costs of their driver education programs;
- compare their driver education per pupil cost with per pupil costs for other courses offered in the same school;
- compare the driver education per pupil cost with other schools' driver education per pupil costs;

- analyze the particular cost advantages of alternative methods and approaches already practiced by schools throughout the State; and
- schedule for the annual school district meeting a discussion of
  - whether any school-sponsored driver education program should be continued; and
  - if the program is to be continued, how the course can be provided in the most cost-effective manner available.

BACKGROUND

Driver Education is one of the most expensive programs on a per pupil basis now offered in the secondary schools of New York State. It often costs more than academic subjects such as mathematics, social studies, and English. In the school districts included in this study, per pupil costs ranged from $49 to $362, and averaged $131.

Moreover, since the program is a one semester, half-year long course, the per pupil costs must be doubled to allow for comparison with other academic subjects, since most other courses are generally a full school year in length. On that basis, driver education can be said to cost between $98 and $724 per pupil, per year.

While there is no conclusive evidence that driver education produces a benefit to society, there is a widespread belief that it does. However, it does confer upon students who complete the course certain attractive personal benefits, such as insurance discounts.

From the very inception of the horseless carriage, automobile mechanics and school teachers may have dabbled in driver training, but the first driver education course was probably offered in 1916 in the Gilbert, Minnesota High School. In 1933, one Amos Neyhart offered classroom and behind-the-wheel training at State College High School in Pennsylvania.

By 1936, the idea began to take hold. That year, Pennsylvania State College offered the first college course

for teachers; the American Automobile Association sponsored a 40-hour course for high school teachers in Bluefield, West Virginia. 1936 was also the year driver and safety education became a part of the secondary school curriculum in New York State.

Seventeen years later, in 1953, 43,000 New York State students were taking driver training. By 1963, almost 75,000 students were enrolled in driver education courses, and by 1973 that number had risen to more than 150,000. During the 1972-73 school year 152,214 secondary school students enrolled in driver education. This represented 28 percent of the total 11th and 12th grade enrollment that year.

In the 1972-73 school year, including the summer of 1973, 1,700 New York State secondary school driver education programs were approved by the State Education Department and 1,373 actually taught, of which 452 were public and private summer school programs.*

Driver education, of and by itself, is not required to be offered in the public schools either by law or State Education Department regulation, although the Education Law (Section 806) requires the State Board of Regents to prescribe courses in highway safety. Parents, safety groups and others, however, promote driver education programs.

---

* Source: State Education Department, Safety Education Unit.

Students now taking driver education must receive a minimum of 48 hours of instruction - four, forty minute periods per week for a semester of at least 18 weeks, or the equivalent. Thirty-six periods must be classroom instruction, and at least an additional 36 periods must be laboratory (in-car) instruction, using automobiles or driving simulators. Students must receive the classroom and laboratory segments of the course in the same semester.

By Education Department policy,* the classroom segment is limited to 36 students. Special Departmental approval is required for larger classroom groups. The in-car instruction is limited to a maximum of four students at one time.

Driver education may be offered as part of an approved summer program as long as the total hourly requirements are met.

The following table shows the division of the 48 hours required by the Education Department for approved driver education programs:

Segment	Hours	Teacher Qualification
Classroom	24	Certified secondary school teacher.**
Laboratory		Certified secondary school teacher** or licensed commercial driving school teacher.
Observation	18	
Driving Time	6	
Total	48	

* State Education Department, "Driver and Traffic Safety Education Policies," Policy A16, January 1971.

** In addition, teachers must have provisional or permanent Education Department approval to teach driver education.

Up to 12 hours of the laboratory portion may be fulfilled by students working in driving simulators or driving on a multiple vehicle facility. There are no alternatives presently available for the classroom segment.

The Education Department's Safety Education Unit is responsible for

- reviewing and evaluating driver education programs;
- assisting in training driver education teachers;
- establishing qualifications for driver education teachers and programs;
- assisting schools in curriculum development;
- acting upon applications of candidates who want to teach driver education;
- acting upon applications of schools who want to start driver education programs; and
- annually approving summer school driver education programs.

There are four methods* used to teach driver education in the schools

- the dual control method using an automobile equipped with dual control brakes and dual mirrors;

---

* In all cases the classroom portion of the course is taught by a certified secondary school teacher.

— the simulator method which uses an electro-mechanical driving simulator, similar to a Link trainer;

— the driving range method which employs an off-street facility where an instructor may work with several vehicles simultaneously; and

— an arrangement where commercial driving schools may, under contract, teach the laboratory part of the course.

In addition, driver education may be offered:

— during the regular school day;

— before or after the regular school day;

— on Saturdays; or

— as a summer program.

Each of the methods and approaches used are described in more detail in the "Findings" section of this report.

To be eligible to take driver education, a student must be at least 16 years of age and have the written consent of his parent or guardian. Beyond these qualifications, schools may establish their own restrictions on eligibility; for example, they may limit entrance to the program to seniors in high school.

FINDINGS

No information is available on the total statewide cost of driver education. To assess the magnitude of driver education in New York State, and to evaluate the various methods and approaches used to teach the course, the Office of Education Performance Review surveyed 67 driver education programs offered at various school districts throughout the State.* Care was taken to assure that the survey was geographically representative, and that programs representing each of the prevalent teaching methods were included in the survey.

A total of 11,313 students were enrolled in the 67 programs, at a total cost of $1,477,949. Per pupil costs of the various programs ranged from $49 to $362 averaging $131. Based on this sample, it can be estimated that the statewide cost of driver education during the 1972-73 school year was approximately $20 million.**

Teacher salaries and fringe benefits ranged up to 99 percent of total program costs, averaging 87 percent. If programs using commercial driving schools are excluded, teacher salaries and fringes averaged 95 percent of total program costs.

The 67 programs surveyed were taught in the following manner:

— 32 were regular school day, dual control programs;

---

* See Appendix for a complete listing of cost and enrollment data for all 67 programs.

** 152,214 (1972-73 statewide enrollment) x $131 (average survey per pupil cost) = $19.94 million.

- 4 were regular school day, simulator programs;
- 3 were regular school day, commercial driving school programs;
- 16 were after school, Saturday, and summer, dual control programs;
- 9 were after school, Saturday, and summer, simulator programs; and
- 3 were after school, Saturday, and summer commercial driving school programs.

To assess the cost impact of offering the course at various times and through various methods of teaching, each type of program surveyed will be discussed individually.

Regular School Day
Dual Control

The traditional method of teaching driver education is the dual control car method with one instructor teaching the laboratory segment of the program to a maximum of four students at a time in an automobile equipped with dual control brakes. This method, the most widely used in New York State, was also the most costly method and approach surveyed.

As noted previously, 32 of the 67 surveyed programs used the dual control method, teaching the course during the regular school year. The following table shows the 1972-73 school year costs for each of these programs.

Program	County Where School District Located	Total Cost	Number of Students	Per Pupil Cost
1	Nassau	$28,960	80	$362
2	Herkimer	9,954	32	311
3	Suffolk	41,563	160	260
4	Rockland	38,249	176	217
5	Suffolk	68,291	336	203
6	Westchester	42,086	208	202
7	Genesee	14,285	73	196
8	Jefferson	40,155	208	193
9	Franklin	5,400*	28	193
10	Warren	34,653	182	190
11	Suffolk	41,985	224	187
12	Cayuga	13,381	72	186
13	Delaware	5,363	31	173
14	Cattaraugus	8,254	48	172
15	Otsego	7,127	42	170
16	Erie	46,169	271	170
17	Saratoga	9,108*	58	157
18	Oswego	14,989	96	156
19	Allegany	4,025*	26	155
20	Nassau	122,992	828	149
21	Washington	6,863*	52	132
22	Dutchess	7,361*	56	131
23	Orange	35,648	274	130
24	Suffolk	12,647	99	128
25	Onieda	24,116	205	118
26	Clinton	13,873	120	116
27	Steuben	5,734*	51	112
28	Onondaga	10,328	96	108
29	Madison	7,810*	73	107
30	Seneca	7,864	110	71
31	Niagara	17,102	240	71
32	Chautagua	7,218	110	66
Totals		$753,553	4,665	$162**

As the table shows, program costs vary widely across the state. Within this portion of the sample, the highest program expenditure was $122,992 while the lowest program expenditure was $4,025.

---

* Shared services program. These programs do not appear to uniformly reduce per pupil expenditures.

** Average

Per pupil costs also vary widely from $66 to $362, a difference of approximately 550 percent. A driver education program in Genesee County for 73 pupils cost $14,285, while another program for 73 pupils in Madison County offered through a shared-services program cost $7,810, a difference of 83 percent.

The number of students enrolled in a program does not directly correlate with costs. A Seneca County program for 110 students cost $71 per pupil, while a Niagara County program also cost $71 per pupil, but served 240 students.

Costs vary within geographical regions and even within counties. The following table lists 1972-73 school year costs for programs in the Nassau-Suffolk region:

Program	County Where School District Located	Total Cost	Number of Students	Per Pupil Cost
1	Nassau	$28,960	80	$362
3	Suffolk	41,563	160	260
5	Suffolk	68,291	336	203
11	Suffolk	41,985	224	187
20	Nassau	122,992	828	149
24	Suffolk	12,647	99	128

While two of these schools (number 3 and 11) spend comparable amounts for their programs, one school is able to teach the course to 40 percent more students than the other, thereby reducing its per pupil cost by $73.

Regular School Day
Simulator

With special approval from the State Education Department a school district may use driving simulators in its driver education programs. A driving simulator is an electro-mechanical device (similar to a Link trainer) which approximates the driver's compartment in an automobile. Students manipulate the simulator in response to a movie projected on a screen. The student's reactions to driving conditions are monitored and recorded.

The State Education Department permits simulator time to be substituted for in-car laboratory time for a maximum of 12 hours. Each student must still receive at least an additional 12 hours of in-car training on public streets and highways, with 3 of these 12 hours spent behind the wheel.

Simulator systems are generally designed to accommodate at least 12 students and can be controlled by one teacher, thereby increasing the potential pupil teacher ratio from 1:4 to 1:12.

Four of the programs surveyed used simulators in their regular school day programs. The following table summarizes their 1972-73 school year costs:

Program	County Where School District Located	Total Cost	Number of Students	Per Pupil Cost
33	Suffolk	$63,671	384	$166
34	Erie	58,604	380	154
35	Albany	55,552	365	152
36	Nassau	34,790	288	121
Totals		$212,617	1,417	$150*

A new twelve-unit simulator system installed in a classroom costs approximately $30,000. Factory reconditioned simulators can be purchased for approximately 50 percent of the cost of a new simulator. The costs shown above do not reflect amortization of driving simulators.

Without these amortization charges the average per pupil cost for regular school year programs using simulators was $12 or seven percent less per pupil than regular school year dual control programs. Although the simulator programs were less costly than half of the dual control programs, they were more costly than eight dual control programs.

Regular School Day
Commercial Driving School

The Vehicle and Traffic Law (Section 507) and the policies of the State Education Department permit a school district to contract with licensed commercial driving schools for the laboratory portion of driver education programs.

The contract between the commercial school and the school district must require that commercial instructors have

* Average

completed a 30-hour course in driver training and traffic safety. Although there are approximately 550 commercial driving schools in New York State, the Education Department estimates that less than ten school districts contract with commercial driving schools for the laboratory segment of their driver education programs.

Although only 3 of the 67 survey programs used commercial driving schools during the regular school day, they taught 9.1 percent of the students in the sample. Program costs for these districts are summarized in the following table:

Program	County Where School District Located	Total Cost	Number of Students	Per Pupil Cost
37	Rockland	$90,177	576	$157
38	Rockland	19,755	233	85
39	Suffolk	16,928	224	76
Totals		$126,860	1,033	$123*

The use of commercial driving schools for the laboratory segment of the program dramatically reduces program costs. The per pupil cost differences shown are attributable to varying district rates for certified teacher compensation for the classroom portion, rather than to variances in commercial school charges. Commercial driving schools charged school 37, $66 per pupil; school 38, $72 per pupil; and school 39, $68 per pupil. (See Appendix for a complete listing of all program costs.)

* Average

After School, Saturday and Summer Dual Control

State Education Department policies require that driver education be taught between 7 A.M. and 5 P.M. However, the Education Law (Section 3604) permits it to be taught on Saturdays.

Driver education may also be offered as part of an approved summer high school program of at least 30 session days. Pupils may receive a maximum of 90 minutes of classroom instruction and 90 minutes of laboratory instruction per day. The Education Department requires annual approval for these summer courses.

Normally, teachers are employed on an hourly or flat fee basis for programs offered at times other than during the regular school day or regular school year. The rate of compensation is generally determined by mutual agreement between school officials and teachers, or may be established in union contracts.

Sixteen of the 67 districts examined offered driver education, using the dual control method, at times other than the regular school day or year. The following table summarizes the costs of each of these programs:

Program	County Where School District Located	Total Cost	Number of Students	Per Pupil Cost
40	Nassau	$24,480	170	$144
41	Rockland	11,862	84	141
42	Jefferson	20,458	176	116
43	Suffolk	18,522	160	116
44	Suffolk	14,746	128	115
45	Rockland	5,491	48	114
46	Nassau	39,201	470	83
47	Suffolk	2,054	27	76
48	Nassau	14,848	196	76
49	Tioga	7,058	102	69
50	Onieda	9,657	144	67
51	Erie	11,278	171	66
52	Herkimer	2,515	40	63
53	Cattaraugus	1,870	32	58
54	Seneca	3,045	55	55
55	Steuben	1,122	23	49
Totals		$188,207	2,026	$93*

As illustrated, offering driver education after school, on Saturday, or in a summer program can drastically reduce expenditures. The average per pupil cost for a dual control program offered during the regular school year was $162. Compared to the $93 per pupil cost shown above, the regular school year programs averaged $69 or 74 percent more in cost. It is interesting to note that school number 40 in Nassau County offered a driver education program to 170 students at a cost of $24,480, while school number 51 in Erie County offered a driver education program to 171 pupils for 46 percent of the cost of the Nassau school. As is true of all the programs surveyed, there was no apparent direct relationship between the number of pupils enrolled and the per pupil cost.

---

* Average

After School, Saturday, and Summer Simulator

Eight of the 65 surveyed programs were programs conducted after school, on Saturdays or during the summer, using a driving simulator for a portion of the laboratory segment. The costs for these programs offered during the 1972-73 school year are summarized below:

Program	County Where School District Located	Total Cost	Number of Students	Per Pupil Cost
56	Nassau	$60,819	380	$160
57	Westchester	3,229	27	120
58	Nassau	18,063	196	92
59	Suffolk	14,373	168	86
50	Madison	8,446	100	84
61	Nassau	6,825	90	76
62	Westchester	4,355	58	75
63	Erie	15,092	220	69
64	Albany	11,414	180	63
Totals		$142,616	1,419	$101*

As illustrated, unit costs range from $63 to $160 per pupil a difference of $97 or 154 percent. A Suffolk County school district operated a program for 168 students at a cost of $14,373, while an Erie County school operated a program for 52 more pupils for an additional $719.

As is true of dual control method programs offered at times other than the regular school day or year, the average per pupil cost is far lower than any type of program operated during the regular school day or regular school year.

---

* Average

After School, Saturday, and Summer Commercial Driving School

Only three of the 67 surveyed programs were offered at non-regular school hours using a commercial driving school for a portion of the laboratory segment. The following table summarizes costs for these programs:

Program	County Where School District Located	Total Cost	Number of Students	Per Pupil Cost
65	Rockland	$ 8,949	100	$ 89
66	Suffolk	27,588	392	70
67	Nassau	17,559	261	67
Totals		$54,096	753	$ 72*

It is apparent that this method of driver training is by far the most economical method of all those surveyed yet only 4.5 percent of the sample used it. The average per pupil cost is less than half that of two types of programs (dual control and simulator) offered during the regular school day, and is $51 or 41 percent percent less per pupil than the third regular school day program.

In addition to the methods examined in this study, driver education is also offered by the multiple vehicle or driving range method. With this method, a number of vehicles are used simultaneously on a special off-street facility under the direction of one or more teachers positioned outside the vehicles. Communication between teacher and student is accomplished by radio, or loudspeaker.

---

* Average

There are seven multiple vehicle facilities in the state, offering the program to approximately one and a third percent of all driver education students in the state. There were no multiple vehicle programs included in this survey. The use of multiple vehicle facilities involves the availability of land and variable capital expenditures which must be included in any program costs.

Numerous studies of driver education throughout the country have failed to uncover any significant qualitative differences in the various methods and approaches used to teach the course. One method appears to be as good as another. However, solidly demonstrable differences can be found in the area of cost, as has been shown in the preceeding tables.

As a further demonstration of the effect of method and approach on per pupil costs, the following table shows costs for courses taught during the regular school day compared with the summer programs conducted by the same school using the same method:

	Per Pupil Costs	
School	Regular School Day	Summer Program
A	$311	$ 63
B	217	114
C	203	115
D	193	116
E	172	58
F	166	86
G	154	69
H	128	76
I	121	92
J	118	67
K	112	49

As shown, summer programs dramatically reduce costs. School A's regular school day program cost of $311 was $248 or almost 400 percent more costly than its summer program. School E's regular school day program cost of $172 was $114 or almost 200 percent more costly. Four of the 11 schools shown on this table cut their per pupil expenditures by half or more in summer programs, and 8 of the 11 schools cut their per pupil costs by 40 percent or more.

Personal Benefits

Regardless of the method or approach used to teach driver education, a student completing the course (achieving grades of 65 or better in both the classroom and laboratory segments) receives a half-unit of Regents credit applied toward graduation requirements. In addition, he also receives from the Department of Motor Vehicles a MV 285 "Blue Card" certificate. This certificate grants the holder some attractive personal benefits:

- exemption from the written examination when applying for a New York State operator's license;
- exemption from three-hours of classroom instruction required of all other novice applicants for a license;
- eligibility to apply for a Type 5 or "senior" driver's license at age 17 rather than 18; and

— a reduction of from 5 to 15 percent in automobile liability and collision insurance from some insurance companies.

It is obvious that students are attracted to driver education by these benefits, particularly the benefit of legal mobility during the hours of darkness.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The wide variation in driver education costs - from $49 to $362 per pupil - or some 735 percent is attributable to the method and approach used to teach the course.

To summarize, based on the survey sample of 67 driver education programs, the following are the average per pupil costs for each type of program:

Regular school day*	
Dual control	$162
Simulator	$150
Commercial driving school	$123
After school, Saturday and summer*	
Dual control	$ 93
Simulator	$101
Commercial driving school	$ 72
Average - all surveyed programs	$131

As this table shows, driver education taught using the dual control method during the regular school day cost an average of $162 per pupil. The same course taught at a time other than during the regular school day cost an average of $93, making the regular school day program $69 or 74 percent more costly.

Based on these average costs, any school district now

---

* In all cases the classroom portion of the course was taught by a certified secondary school teacher.

offering a course using the dual control method to 300 pupils during the regular school day could reduce its expenditures by $27,000 by scheduling it before or after the regular school day, on Saturdays or as a summer program, and contracting with a commercial driving school for the laboratory portion.

In view of this disparity of expenditures, and the fact that certain methods and approaches can dramatically reduce costs without a demonstrable difference in effectiveness, school district boards of education should promptly

- determine the true and complete costs of their driver education programs;
- compare their driver education per pupil cost to per pupil costs for other courses offered in the same school;
- compare the driver education per pupil cost to other schools' driver education per pupil costs;
- analyze the particular cost advantages of alternative methods and approaches already practiced by schools throughout the State; and
- schedule for the annual school district meeting a discussion of
  - — whether any school-sponsored driver education program should be continued; and
  - — if the program is to be continued, how the course can be provided in the most cost-effective manner available.

OFFICE OF EDUCATION PERFORMANCE REVIEW

Program Cost and Enrollment Data
67 Driver Education Programs

Program	Type of Program /	County Where School District Located	Number of Teachers	Teacher Compensation	Total Cost	Number of Pupils	Per Pupil Cost
1	DR	Nassau	1	$25,456	$28,960	80	$362
2	DR	Herkimer	2	8,700	9,954	32	311
3	DR	Suffolk	2	40,631	41,563	160	260
4	DR	Rockland	2	37,500	38,249	176	217
5	DR	Suffolk	3.5	64,695	68,291	336	203
6	DR	Westchester	2	40,984	42,086	208	202
7	DR	Genesee	1	13,405	14,285	73	196
8	DR	Jefferson	2	38,988	40,155	208	193
9*	DR	Franklin			5,400	28	193
10	DR	Warren	3	32,895	34,653	182	190
11	DR	Suffolk	2	40,869	41,985	224	187
12	DR	Cayuga	1	12,881	13,381	72	186
13	DR	Delaware	1	3,833	5,363	31	173
14	DR	Cattaraugus	1	8,179	8,254	48	172
15	DR	Otsego	1	6,126	7,127	42	170
16	DR	Erie	6	45,159	46,169	271	170
17*	DR	Saratoga			9,108	58	157
18	DR	Oswego	1	14,700	14,989	96	156

/ See legend on page 4 of Appendix

Program	Type of Program	County Where School District Located	Number of Teachers	Teacher Compensation	Total Cost	Number of Pupils	Per Pupil Cost
19 *	DR	Allegany			$ 4,025	26	$155
20	DR	Nassau	6	$120,098	122,992	828	149
21 *	DR	Washington			6,863	52	132
22 *	DR	Dutchess			7,361	56	131
23	DR	Orange	2	34,817	35,648	274	130
24	DR	Suffolk	1	11,904	12,647	99	128
25	DR	Oneida	2	22,820	24,116	205	118
26	DR	Clinton	1	13,500	13,873	120	116
27 *	DR	Steuben			5,734	51	112
28	DR	Onondaga	1	9,715	10,328	96	108
29 *	DR	Madison			7,810	73	107
30	DR	Seneca	1	6,964	7,864	110	71
31	DR	Niagara	4	16,338	17,102	240	71
32	DR	Chautauqua	1	5,644	7,218	110	66
33	SR	Suffolk	3	63,156	63,671	384	166
34	SR	Erie	3.82	57,424	58,604	380	154
35	SR	Albany	3.2	51,681	55,552	365	152
36	SR	Nassau	2	33,359	34,790	288	121

Program	Type of Program	County Where School District Located	Number of Teachers	Teacher Compensation	Total Cost	Number of Pupils	Per Pupil Cost
37	CR	Rockland	2	$50,243	$90,177	576	$157
38	CR	Rockland	2	3,899	19,755	233	85
39	CR	Suffolk	1	800	16,928	224	76
40	DS	Nassau	15	19,890	24,480	170	144
41	DS	Rockland	4	11,262	11,862	84	141
42	DS	Jefferson	8	15,245	20,458	176	116
43	DS	Suffolk	10	15,682	18,522	160	116
44	DS	Suffolk	5	13,347	14,746	128	115
45	DS	Rockland	3	5,292	5,491	48	114
46	DS	Nassau	30	36,550	39,201	470	83
47	DS	Suffolk	1	1,857	2,054	27	76
48	DS	Nassau	20	13,847	14,848	196	76
49	DS	Tioga	3	6,750	7,058	102	69
50	DS	Oneida	9	9,072	9,657	144	67
51	DS	Erie	10	10,680	11,278	171	66
52	DS	Herkimer	2	2,000	2,515	40	63
53	DS	Cattaraugus	1	1,785	1,870	32	58
54	DS	Seneca	2	2,555	3,045	55	55
55	DS	Steuben	1	1,000	1,122	23	49

Program	Type of Program	County Where School District Located	Number of Teachers	Teacher Compensation	Total Cost	Number of Pupils	Per Pupil Cost
56	SS	Nassau	9.67	$59,469	$60,819	380	$160
57	SS	Westchester	2	2,973	3,229	27	120
58	SS	Nassau	8	17,463	18,063	196	92
59	SS	Suffolk	5	14,152	14,373	168	86
60	SS	Madison	5	6,292	8,446	100	84
61	SS	Nassau	3	6,375	6,825	90	76
62	SS	Westchester	1	3,811	4,355	58	75
63	SS	Erie	9	14,884	15,092	220	69
64	SS	Albany	5	9,504	11,414	180	63
65	CS	Rockland	1	2,053	8,949	100	89
66	CS	Suffolk	1	2,167	27,588	392	70
67	CS	Nassau	2	4,014	17,559	261	67
	Totals		243.19	$1,247,334	$1,477,949	11,313	$130.64**

DR - Dual Control - Regular School Day
SR - Simulator - Regular School Day
CR - Commercial Driving School - Regular School Day
DS - Dual Control - After School, Saturday, and Summer
SS - Simulator - After School, Saturday, and Summer
CS - Commercial Driving School - After School, Saturday, and Summer

* shared - services programs
** Average